

# PROPOSED MEMORIAL ON ERF 95135, DELVILLE WOOD MEMORIAL GARDEN IN THE CAPE TOWN COMPANY'S GARDEN

## COMMENTS AND RESPONSES TRAIL

### Focus Group Meetings

The below information summarises issues raised within the Focus Group Meetings held during Phase 1 of the Public Participation Process. The responses have been gathered from the CWGC and the project planning team. Please refer to **Appendix H** within the Public Participation Report for a copy of the comprehensive Focus Group Meeting notes.

No.	Name:	Comment/Question:	Project Team Response:
<b>ADMINISTRATION</b>			
1.	Ms. Maurietta Stewart CCT Environment and Heritage department	I feel the naming of the memorial should be part of the public process as language is an important aspect.	Traditional CWGC naming conventions tend to focus on geography and place rather than who or what or the service of those a memorial commemorates.  For example, our most iconic memorial in the Belgian city of Ieper is named after one of this historic entrance gates to the city on which the memorial is now sited – The Menin Gate.  If we kept to that convention this new memorial would simply be called The Cape Town Memorial.
2.	Mr. Zunaid Allie City of Cape Town	What is the proposed timeline until the construction is completed?	We anticipate the competition to start in March 2022 with construction planned for the second half of 2023. The construction period for the project is estimated to be four months.
3.	Mr. Zunaid Allie City of Cape Town	Where does the funding for the memorial come from?	There is a budget set for the construction of the memorial which will form part of the competition brief. Costing must be submitted from a relevant organisation.  The cost of the construction of the memorial will be fully funded by the CWGC.
4.		How will the construction process and appointment occur?	Whoever wins the competition will be appointed as the architect for the job. They will then need to complete

			<p>building plans and other required approvals before construction can take place.</p> <p>CWGC is still in discussion on who will oversee the construction of the memorial.</p>
<b>PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCESS</b>			
5.	Ms. Maurietta Stewart CCT Environment and Heritage department	In terms of the descendants of the servicemen to be memorialised, has there been attempts to find them and draw them into the conversation and process?	<p>Significant effort has been made by the CWGC in trying to locate descendants.</p> <p>Where there isn't information available, the CWGC team have been primarily working through the major organisations in the country both on a national and local level.</p> <p>In addition, the CWGC have previously conducted a publicity campaign called "The Sons of South Africa", where a large call for information on servicemen and their descendants was advertised through radio programs, community newspapers and media campaigns. This is an ongoing process.</p> <p>The memorial will make space available for additional names to be added should more information be made available.</p>
6.	Dean Michael Wheeler St Georges Cathedral	There needs to be a conversation, as much as the Cathedral is here, with other stakeholders such as the District Six Museum and the Holocaust Museum. There needs to be a conversation that heightens the integrity of the memorial.	At the outset of the public participation process, Chand compiled database of key Interested and Affected Parties. The District Six Museum and the Holocaust Museum are on this list and were invited to the Focus Group Meetings. Existing participants have also been invited to contribute additional parties to the database.
<b>SCOPE OF THE MEMORIAL</b>			
7.	Ms. Laura Robinson Cape Town Heritage Trust (CTHT)  Mr. Kevin Ashton Chairman: Gunners Association: Western Province	What is meant by 'Black' South Africans? What is the difference between indigenous and black South Africans?	<p>The term 'black' is used to in its most inclusive, contemporary South African sense to refer to people who are 'African, Coloured and Indian' as defined by the South African BBBEE Amendment Act.</p> <p>The term 'indigenous' was used in the report to mean "originating or occurring naturally in South Africa" and referred to the indicator specifying that the style or design of the memorial should be South Africa</p>

	Ms. Maurietta Stewart CCT Environment and Heritage department		referenced. However, it is accepted this could be misconstrued and the term has been replaced with a suitable alternative.
8.	Mr. Henry August South African coloured Cape Corps Ex – Servicemen's Legion	Could this memorial be combined with those who lost their lives at the Battle of Square Hill and who have not been honoured yet?	This project deals specifically with the labour corps units.  Additionally, it is CWGC policy not to commemorate our war dead twice and ensure they are commemorated at the most fitting location relating to their service and sacrifice. As this engagement occurred in modern day Israel/Palestine any casualties from the engagement are already commemorated by the CWGC in Jerusalem War Cemetery.
9.	Mr Shaun Booth National Department Military Veterans	Is this memorial only looking at the African continent?	The project is commemorating the labour corps that served in Africa only. It does not include the European labour contingents.
10.	Mr. Kevin Ashton Chairman: Gunners Association: Western Province	We have an initiative to turn the site area into a memorial acre, including Square Hill, to allow for memorialisation events.  This project is a potential catalyst to further that idea.	Noted. The CWGC is only responsible for the commemoration of Commonwealth war dead from the First and second World Wars. Outside of these conflicts they have no responsibility. As such, this would fall outside of their remit or scope of this project – which is intended to address a very specific and historical issue relating to the commemoration of these individuals.  However, while the CWGC does not traditionally organise remembrance events itself, they would welcome such an occurrence. Indeed, they hope the memorial might be a catalyst for ongoing remembrance and learning activity.
11.	Mr. Marek Kedzija Western Cape Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning	If you are seeking to be as inclusive as possible, then including female members of the armed forces, who may have not been memorialised in the Delville Wood component, who may have also escaped memorialisation must occur.	Noted. This memorial has a specific focus, and the names are not elicited on the basis of gender or any other criteria, other than that they served.
12.	Dean Michael Wheeler St Georges Cathedral	This memorial redresses only a sliver of past racial injustices. The Khoi and the San, southern Indians, Asians and other Africans need to be acknowledged.	All of these nuances are incredibly important and lend themselves to a wider conversation.

			This possibility goes beyond the scope of the project team. It is acknowledged that the redressing of past social and racial injustices is a worthwhile and ongoing endeavour which should be addressed with the relevant parties on a case-by-case basis.
<b>SUPPORT FOR THE MEMORIAL</b>			
13.	Ms. Laura Robinson Cape Town Heritage Trust (CTHT)	I support the approach being taken for the memorial.	Noted. Thank you for conveying your support for the proposed memorial.
14.	Mr. Zunaid Allie City of Cape Town	This process is wonderful and great for Cape Town and something we have been thinking of developing for a while and is all coming together.	Noted. Thank you for conveying your support for the proposed memorial.
15.	Mr. Henry August South African coloured Cape Corps Ex – Servicemen's Legion	The memorial is a good idea. It is time for the Coloureds and Indians and Blacks to see there is a memorial for their people to come and view.	Noted. Thank you for conveying your support for the proposed memorial.
<b>OPERATIONAL PHASE</b>			
16.	Mr. David Hart CCT Environment and Heritage department  Mr. Kevin Ashton Chairman: Gunners Association: Western Province  Mr. Zunaid Allie City of Cape Town  Mr. Robin Jutzen City of Cape Town: Arts and Culture	Who will the ownership of the memorial fall under?	The City of Cape Town is allowing for the proposed memorial to be built on its land. The memorial will be owned by the CWGC who will form an agreement with the City of Cape Town (Parks and Recreation Department) regarding maintenance.
17.	Mr. Kevin Ashton Chairman: Gunners Association: Western Province	It would be important to hold a memorial event on an annual basis like with the other memorials in the area.	While CWGC does not traditionally organise remembrance events itself, the CWGC would welcome such an occurrence. Indeed, they hope the memorial

			might be a catalyst for ongoing remembrance and learning activity.
18.	Mr. Zunaid Allie City of Cape Town  Mr. James Boale City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality	Vandalism is a real issue that needs to be addressed. Consider how to ensure sustainability of the memorial.	Maintenance, vandalism, and security are already included as considerations in the Design Guidelines and competition brief.
<b>HERITAGE PROCESS</b>			
19.	Mr. Phillip Hine South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA)	Will there be a second round of public consultation after the design has been approved or finalised? When will the documentation be submitted to HWC for approval?	There will be a second round of public participation that will run during Phase 2 of the heritage process.  While it is acknowledged that the public will be interested in the design itself, it is important that the public do comment at this current stage of the process. The second round of public participation will assume that all principles set up in the architectural competition guidelines and heritage statements are acceptable. The team will not go back to first principles, rather it will focus on the extent of the winning design meeting the indicators and the guidelines set.  It is not possible to predict the timeframes of the project with absolute certainty, but we anticipate the competition to commence in March 2022 with construction planned for the second half of 2023. The construction period for the project is estimated to be four months.
<b>MEMORIAL DESIGN</b>			
20.	Mr. Willem Hutton City of Cape Town  Ms. Adelaide Combrink City of Cape Town: Environmental and Heritage Management  Mr. Kevin Ashton	The relationship between the existing Delville Wood Memorial and the proposed memorial needs to be sensitively considered in the design. One should not be seen as 'subservient' to the other. Each should stand on their own, while acknowledging a link/flow between them, as they are part of the same event.	Agreed. This is already included as a heritage indicator and forms part of the design guidelines and competition brief. However, the diagram indicating height limits will be amended to respond to this more clearly.

	<p>Chairman: Gunners Association: Western Province</p> <p>Mr. Andrew Derns</p> <p>Mr. Leon Robinson Memorable Order of Tin Hats (MOTHS)</p> <p>Mr. Shaun Booth National Department Military Veterans</p>		
21.	<p>Mr. Leon Steyn SA Navy Museum</p> <p>Mr. Shaun Booth National Department Military Veterans</p> <p>Ms. Laura Robinson Cape Town Heritage Trust (CTHT)</p> <p>Ms. Lesley Cox Cape Walking Tours</p>	<p>The experience, visual nature and learning experience is important as some memorials don't entice engagement with the public.</p> <p>It would be great to incorporate a link to a museum or other educational material on the relevance of the WW1 labour corps and Delville Wood so that when people visit the memorial, they may have questions answered.</p> <p>Storyboards at the site can help link the two memorials, educating audiences on how some of the troops were transferred from Africa into France to continue to war effort. To have the gold thread running through.</p> <p>A QR code would help educate people on the memorial and events it represents. This is the digital world and when you are looking at the proposed memorial it will have a physicality, but it also needs some form of digital engagement to reach the younger generation.</p>	<p>The CWGC would welcome linkages with museums and other learning institutions. The CWGC will add interpretive information to the site and develop education resources that generate engagement for the memorial and the individuals it is designed to commemorate.</p>

22.	Mr. Kevin Ashton Chairman: Gunners Association: Western Province	This memorial is a great opportunity to have something contemporary and interactive, where school children can take the mantle since there are very limited numbers of youth joining military organisations (i.e., M.O.T.H.S, Gunners Associations etc.)  It must be interactive but also have a balance.	Noted. The CWGC will add interpretive information to the site and develop education resources that generate engagement for the memorial and the individuals it is designed to commemorate.
23.	Ms, Lesley Cox Cape Walking Tours	The memorial should preserve the view of Table Mountain. Could the height aspect of the memorial be reconsidered to allow for a small section to be taller?	Agreed. This is already included as a heritage indicator and forms part of the design guidelines and competition brief. However, the diagram indicating height limits will be amended to respond to this more clearly.
24.	Mr. James Boale City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality  Mr. Ngqabutho Madida	I have noted that many memorials' architectural style is similar. How will this differ with the memorial we have in South Africa?  Will this design have a particular feature that will represent Africa or South Africa, so that it can resemble elements that align with our history and perspective?  Incorporating indigenous knowledge systems in the design may be both aesthetically pleasing and relevant to what the team is trying to achieve.	One of the exercises that was conducted during the various FGMs was to ask the attendees to provide a few words that they would use as their vision for the memorial. These "popcorn" words have been included in the back of the guidelines document to aid designers to think "outside the box".  From this comment it is understood that you would like the memorial to be relatable, informative and the design to reflect our history.  Additionally, the team will ensure to express in the documentation provided that the memorial's design must have an African and South African relevance. It must be a memorialisation of this place and time, reflecting the current thinking of the people in South Africa. While this project be memorialising an event that happened almost a century ago, it must be interpreted in contemporary ways.
<b>ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN COMPETITION</b>			
25.	Ms. Maurietta Stewart CCT Environment and Heritage department	How will advertising of the architectural design competition occur?	The competition administrators have been appointed by the CWGC. Prof. Paul Kotze and Mr. Mark Schaerer have been appointed to manage the administrative tasks such as website compilation and upload as well as juror appointment.

			The administrators have been previously involved as administrators on large scale architectural competitions.
26.	Ms. Maurietta Stewart CCT Environment and Heritage department  Mr. Kevin Ashton Chairman: Gunners Association: Western Province	Will the competition be inclusive, for example include black architects and schools?	The competition must be endorsed by the South African Institute of Architects, and they approve the jurors and their eligibility.  The CWGC, being funded through its various member countries, is bound to comply with the South African Government procurement policies in this regard.
27.	Mr. David Hart CCT Environment and Heritage department	Are the competition guidelines rules or visions?	The Guidelines and Briefing document set out a series of broad principles which need to be complied with, but also includes a series of direct guidelines which should directly inform the design solution of the proposed memorial.  In order to ensure that the Architectural Competition is fair and legal, the design proposals should comply with the design guidelines and brief. Additionally, compliance to the Design Guidelines and Brief will ensure that the statutory heritage and local authority approvals are complied with and achieved down the line
28.	Ms. Lesley Cox Cape Walking Tours	How many entries is the team expecting to receive?	There have been several large competitions run in which younger architects find it as a vehicle to be recognised, these typically attracted 80-100 firms. With this in mind the team are anticipating receiving between 80-100 submissions.
29.		Will shortlisting of the submissions occur?	This is dependent on the structuring of the competition and adjudication.  Currently, there will be a first round of assessments done with regards to the guidelines. Thereafter the designs will be scored individually within groups. Finally, there will be public exhibitions of the designs to provide a more detailed context and understanding.



## Comments Received via Email Communication

No.	Name:	Comment:	Response:
1.	<p>Mr. Henry August President and National Executive Committee member South African Coloured Cape Corps Ex-Servicemen Legion (SACCEL) 24 November 2021</p>	<p>The South African Coloured Cape Corps Ex-Servicemen's Legion and its executive committee have taken a collective decision to support the WW1 Memorial Project in the Company's Gardens as initiated by the Commonwealth War Graves.</p> <p>As the oldest military veteran organisation in South Africa, our intention is to engage and form strategic relationships with all relevant military institutions and stakeholders while preserving our military history, heritage and military achievements. We ardently believe that this WW1 Memorial Project / Memorial Garden will recognise and honour the coloured combatants and non-combatants who served their country in the Two Great Wars and other war battles.</p> <p>The South African Coloured Ex-Servicemen's Legion and its executive committee would like to submit a special request with regards to the inclusion of Hannah Irish Murphy (also known as Miss Murphy) on the WW1 Memorial Hall. Hannah Irish Murphy had a long-standing medical field service history alongside the Coloured Cape Corps since she joined the Royal Irish Constabulary Hospital Corps, Royal Army Medical Corps and the Red Cross in 1820. After her passing in late 1800, she was buried by the Coloured Cape Corps community while no records exist of her grave in any military or civilian cemetery in the Cape Metropole area. In memory of her service, dedication and commitment to the Coloured community, the Red Cross Hospital was built in remembrance of her service amongst the poor coloured community, while the Coloured Cape</p>	<p>Your organisation's history and contribution are noted and your support for the project is acknowledged.</p> <p>Sadly, her service and death fall outside of our remit, and we are unable to commemorate her in line with the limitations imposed on us by our Royal Charter.</p>

		<p>Corps/ WW1 soldiers contributed their salaries to build the Red Cross Hospital in Cape Town.</p> <p>A further request is to place the Miss Murphy statue next to the WW1 Memorial Hall in remembrance of her service and dedication to uplift the poor Coloured communities while preserving the military history and heritage of the Coloured Cape Corps and coloured non-combatants/ labour units who died on the war battlefield.</p> <p>Thank you for the opportunity to communicate this matter with you, hoping it would receive your urgent attention.</p> <p>For more information do not hesitate to contact me on 072 117 1534 or at <a href="mailto:henryaugust61@gmail.com">henryaugust61@gmail.com</a></p>	
2.	<p>Mr. Andrew Jones Simon Van der Stel Stigting 24 November 2021</p>	<p>I think we need to design a memorial that reflects our modern thinking. It needs to be distinctly different to the original memorials (that were very much of their time) but must be equally impressive. Although you do not want the new structure to be in any way 'subservient' to the existing structures it needs to address the fact that these people were side lined in the original process and to show that this is now being admitted and addressed.</p> <p>I feel we need more input from the community so that it can acknowledge 'African' traditions and iconography. How they would be happy to have their relatives remembered and memorialised.</p> <p>I have absolutely no idea how this is done and it will be a challenge to the design teams to get it right. But it is important that if we are to make this</p>	<p>Agreed. This aspect is specifically highlighted in the Design Guidelines and Briefing document and will form part of the architectural competition. These issues have already been included in the Heritage Indicators and Design Guidelines.</p>

		happen it must be fully inclusive of all the races and ethnic groups that were not recognised in the original process.	
3.	Mr. Kevin Ashton Chairman: Gunners Association: Western Province 28 November 2021	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The memorial should be interpretive and interactive.</li> <li>2. Should be of interest to younger people.</li> <li>3. Include cellphone download option where all information pertaining to the memorial can be seen and heard on a cellphone.</li> <li>4. A modern structure no bigger or smaller than any other in the precinct.</li> <li>5. Design competition should be extended to schools. prizes to the student as well as the school.</li> <li>6. Security staff on the ground could double up as knowledgeable guides. training and employment.</li> <li>7. Area should be closed off after hours. Later in summer. Prevent vandalism.</li> <li>8. Monitored camera system in place.</li> <li>9. Annual memorial services imperative.</li> <li>10. Determine military veterans as co custodians. this will assist with it staying relevant. set up possible trust.</li> <li>11. Design criteria should include easy set up for memorial services.</li> <li>12. Ensure that the relationship to Delville Wood, Gunners Gun and Lucan is explained.</li> <li>13. Possible pairing with the SS Mendi memorial at UCT.</li> </ol>	<p>The design related comments will be considered in the brief compiled for the architectural competition. The need to safeguard the memorial in the operational phase and the suggestions on how to do so will be considered by the CWGC in collaboration with the City of CT.</p> <p>The CWGC would welcome linkages with museums and other learning institutions. Additionally, the CWGC will add interpretive information to the site and develop education resources that generate engagement for the memorial and the individuals it is designed to commemorate.</p> <p>While CWGC does not traditionally organise remembrance events itself, we would welcome such an occurrence. Indeed, they would hope the memorial might be a catalyst for ongoing remembrance and learning activity.</p>
4.	Andrew Hodge with Sonette Smit & Simone Bergoff City of Cape Town – Urban Planning and Design Branch 25 November 2021	<b>Item 1:</b> Design should connect to the various campaign theatres around the African continent, as these are forgotten battlefields and History- SW Africa, East Africa etc.	<p>Item 1: This is noted but it does not form part of the scope of the project.</p> <p>Item 2: Agreed, this can be included in the guidelines</p>

		<p><b>Item 2:</b> Would newly planted trees be subject to the height conditions in the Design Brief? Perhaps, it should be stated that the trees do not form a dense "wall" of planting.</p> <p><b>Item 3:</b> Would the removal of trees in the site area require replacement tree planting at a ratio of 1:1 to preserve the site as a "green lung"? Perhaps this could be suggested in the Design Brief, along with the 50% softscape cover.</p> <p><b>Item 4:</b> The height of groundcover and shrub planting should be considered to reinforce clear view lines from the upper to the lower terrace and in the site area itself. For security concerns. Additionally, there should be no "dead-ends" or unsurveillanced corners in the proposed design.</p> <p><b>Item 5:</b> If new trees are being proposed, the species of these should work with the existing planting. Eg. <i>Quercus cerris</i> etc. for the Delville Wood Memorial Park. Unless a departure from this could be successfully argued for – in the case of a tree species being utilised specifically for the design, for example.</p> <p><b>Item 6:</b> If indigenous, water wise planting is being proposed, as recommended in the Design Brief, the planting of these should also work with the existing landscape of the Memorial Park. It should not be dry xeriscaping for example, as this would depart from the overall look and feel of the site's surrounds. Unless a departure from this could be successfully argued for in the proposed design.</p> <p><b>Item 7:</b> Planting with spikes and thorns should be avoided as this is well frequented by young children, and may cause injuries. Additionally, poisonous plants should also be avoided for the</p>	<p>Item 3: Not necessarily,. This will be left to the designers to respond appropriately.</p> <p>Item 4: Agreed, this can included as part of the guidelines</p> <p>Item 5: It's important not to be prescriptive at this stage, and rather allow interpretation to the designers. A list of existing trees and plants are included in the guidelines.</p> <p>Item 6: This will be left to the interpretation of the designers</p> <p>Item 7: This can included in the guidelines.</p> <p>Item 8: This is covered in the guidelines</p> <p>Item 9: This will be left to the interpretation of the designers</p> <p>Item 10: Agreed, this will be included in the guidelines.</p>
--	--	--	--

		<p>same reason. These items could be added to the Design Brief.</p> <p><b>Item 8:</b> Hardscape materials must be considered for universal access – certain hard surfacing is difficult to walk on or for wheelchair use, eg. Cobbles, gravel etc.</p> <p><b>Item 9:</b> Hardscape materials should not depart from the wider Memorial Garden, to ensure continuity. Unless a departure from this could be successfully argued for in the proposed design.</p> <p><b>Item 10:</b> Hardscape materials and street furniture must be composed of robust, easy to clean and vandal proof to reduce future replacement and maintenance requirements, as the site is in an open public space.</p>	
5.	<p>Ms. A. Combrink and Ms. Maurietta Stewart Environment and Heritage Management Branch 29 November 2021</p>	<p><b><u>CITY HERITAGE COMMENT ON DEVELOPMENT APPLICATIONS POTENTIALLY AFFECTING HERITAGE RESOURCES</u></b></p> <p><b><u>HERITAGE TRIGGERS &amp; SIGNIFICANCE</u></b></p> <p>The Company's Gardens is situated on the site where Commander van Riebeeck originally laid out a garden to supply visiting ships with fresh provisions. In the course of years the garden became a veritable pleasure garden and the pride of the residents of Cape Town. It became famous for its beauty and the variety of its trees, shrubs and flowers, and gained the admiration of visitors. Numerous buildings and structures that are outstanding architectural examples of their period, can be found in the Company's Gardens. The Delville Wood Memorial Garden commemorates the efforts and loss of lives of South Africans during WWI and WWII, particularly Delville Wood, France.</p>	<p>The CCT support is noted with thanks.</p> <p>CWGC have a number of strong partnerships with organisations both in South Africa and elsewhere on the continent as part of their non-Commemorations programme of work. CWGC welcomes the opportunity for further relationships of this kind going forward.</p>

		<p><b><u>PRE-SUBMISSION CONSULTATION (EHM ADVICE TO APPLICANT)</u></b></p> <p>Summary advice to applicant: Application is supported in principle.</p> <p>Additional information requested: No additional information requested at this stage at this stage.</p> <p><b><u>CITY COMMENT ON PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT TO HWC</u></b></p> <p><b>Proposal:</b>  The new memorial is proposed by the Commonwealth War Graves Commission to commemorate black South Africans who lost their lives and who contributed to the First World War. The names of these people have until now not been formally recorded. The project will include a design competition and supported and in line with the South African Institute for Architects (SAIA) guidelines and will entail the development of a design brief.</p> <p>The Company's Gardens in Cape Town has been identified as the location for the memorial and in-depth engagement has taken place with the City's Metropolitan heritage office. The South Western Corner of erf 95135 is proposed as the most appropriate place in the vicinity of the Delville Wood Memorial Garden. The main aim and express purpose of the project is that of redress and it is considered important to the success of the memorial and its meaning, to have it within this space.</p>	
--	--	--	--



*The Dellville Wood Memorial area in the Company's Gardens is located in the south-west portion of erf 95135, as depicted on the screenshot of the 2021 aerial, City map viewer.*



*The location of the proposed memorial will be in the general area of the south-west portion of the Dellville Wood Memorial, Company's Gardens, as depicted on oblique image facing west, City map viewer.*

Erf 95135 is formally protected in terms of section 27 of the National Heritage Act and any proposed work requires a section 27 permit application.



*The demarcated area of the Company's Gardens that is a Provincial Heritage site (PHS) and of which the Dellville Wood Memorial Garden forms part of.*

### **1.City Policy Compliance**

- Memorialisation Policy

The proposal is aligned with the intentions of the City of Cape Town's Memorialisation Policy (12777) C19/07/15 (The Policy). The memorial fits the definition as outlined in Par 5.1.1 of the Policy, reads: Objects, sculptures or structures that are explicitly commemorative in nature, that have designer or artist in the development of the work and which are to be located on land either owned or managed by the city.

The city will consider the establishment of memorials when the history, events, memories or cultural practices relevant to the people of Cape Town are to be honoured (par 5.3.1). In addition, the remembrance of deceased persons or past events that have contributed significantly to the history or development of Cape town or South Africa, must be acknowledged. (5.3.2)

### **City's Environmental Strategy 2017 (Cultural Heritage Strategy embedded)**

The City's Cultural Heritage Strategy refers to the importance of both intangible and tangible



		<p>heritage resources, which includes memory. Memorials of this nature has the potential to link society and contribute to a sense of identity and belonging, especially given the disparate nature of memorialisation in the public realm in our City and Country. Policy 14 of the Cultural heritage strategy, the principals of which are embedded in the City Environmental Strategy 2017, reads as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Policy 14: Tangible and intangible heritage</b>  Cultural value resides in both tangible and intangible heritage. Oral traditions, ceremonies, events and knowledge systems are a vital part of heritage. Intangible heritage enriches the experience of the physical environment through memory and knowledge. Living heritage is an integral part of contemporary experience and links social and individual memory to daily life.</li> </ul> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The City will assist in the identification and recovery of unrecorded historical and cultural knowledge. It will acknowledge that not all aspects of cultural significance find expression in physical fabric but reside in memory and tradition; and</li> <li>- The City will utilise community and academic knowledge and insight to interpret the sites and elements of cultural significance and to communicate their meaning to a wider public.</li> </ul> <p>The City's role in facilitating the remembrance of black persons who died in the First World War, is consistent with both the precepts of the NRHA 25 of 1999, as well as its own Cultural Heritage Strategy and aims for redress and representation of marginalised heritage in the City.</p>	
--	--	---	--

		<p><b>IDP –Strategic focus area 4- And Inclusive City</b></p> <p>The development of the memorial contributes to the fulfilment of strategic area 4 of the City's Integrated Development Programme. The project contributes and promotes what is required for all resident of Cape Town to feel acknowledged and valued through its heritage work, giving cognisance to the issues of redress.</p> <p><b>Engagement</b></p> <p>There has been on-going discussion and engagement via the Director of Environmental Management and with the City's Metropolitan Heritage office in the infancy stages and thinking around the memorial. In so doing, Mr David Hart represented the City in these discussion, before a formal Section 27 application was made.</p> <p><b>Support for the proposal</b></p> <p>E&amp;HM takes note and commends the thorough historical research and illustrated spatial development of the Company's gardens and the DWMG area. The history and the contextualizing of the memorial component of the Gardens is noted.</p> <p>The history of the CWGC and the role that they have played in commemorating those who suffered and lost their lives in the war, is acknowledged, especially their on-going work in acknowledging unseen participants in the military labour force of the First World war. The updating of names as new ones are revealed through the continuous research and locating descendants will be in line with par 3.2.14 of the Memorialisation policy.</p>	
--	--	--	--

		<p>The following aspects of the proposal are supported and endorsed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The identification of the numerous heritage resources of the suggested location of the memorial, including identifying the location itself as a heritage resource, and all motivated significances. The City's Heritage branch has been integrally involved in this identification process.</li> <li>- The emphasis on the reflective and dignified character of the DWMG is supported whilst keeping this in tension with the importance of redress;</li> <li>- The importance, as pointed out in the report, of this area for socializing by locals and tourists, and for being part of a broader green landscape;</li> <li>- The heritage indicators as deliberated in par 11;</li> <li>- The urban design framework and competition guidelines;</li> <li>- E&amp;HM supports and actively encourages design proposals on a larger scale whether in the form of a landscape project only or a landscape project combined with objects, sculptures and structures;</li> <li>- The development of the design through a national design competition;</li> <li>- The anonymous processing and judging of all entrants by the Promotor, Administrator and Adjudicators; and</li> <li>- The agreement of maintenance between the CWGC and the City is supported in this regard as required by par 3.2.5 of the Policy.</li> </ul>	
--	--	--	--

		<p>A suggestion is that a possible collaboration with another African country's institute should not be ruled out, as this could potentially be symbolic of the collective acknowledgment of African losses. It is not known whether this is possible or whether there is such representation in South Africa.</p> <p><b>Recommendation</b></p> <p>E&amp;HM supports the identification of all heritage resources and significances, the heritage informants and the competition guidelines. Our branch will await the further information for input.</p>	
6.	<p>Mr. Columbus Mzkamadoda Gojana NLSA's Centre for the Book 23 November 2021</p>	<p>The idea is very exciting. I fully support the process.</p> <p>This is to give respect equally. The families and communities will benefit a lot. This was a great loss for our country and the world.</p> <p>I can say, this is long overdue.</p>	<p>Your support for the proposed project is acknowledged.</p>